

# Lipschitz functions with maximal Clarke subdifferentials are staunch

JONATHAN M. BORWEIN<sup>1</sup> AND XIANFU WANG<sup>2</sup>

August 7, 2005

**ABSTRACT.** In a recent paper we have shown that most non-expansive Lipschitz functions (in the sense of Baire's category) have a maximal Clarke subdifferential. In the present paper, we show that in a separable Banach space the set of non-expansive Lipschitz functions with a maximal Clarke subdifferential is not only of generic, but also staunch.

**1991 Mathematics Subject Classification:** Primary 49J52.

**Key words and phrases:** Separable Banach spaces, non-expansive function, Clarke subdifferential, complete metric space, porous set, first category set.

---

<sup>1</sup>Research supported by NSERC and the CRC programme.

<sup>2</sup>Research supported by NSERC.

# 1 Introduction and Definitions

Lipschitz functions with maximal subdifferentials provide counter-examples in nonsmooth analysis and differentiability theory. In a recent paper [1], we showed that the set of Lipschitz functions with maximal subdifferentials is residual in the space of all non-expansive functions. The purpose of this note is to strengthen this by showing that, in a separable-setting the set of all non-expansive Lipschitz functions with maximal subdifferentials is not only of residual but also *staunch*, by which we mean the complement of the set is  $\sigma$ -porous. We now recall the appropriate notion of porosity.

Let  $(Y, d)$  be a complete metric space. We denote by  $B(y, r)$  the closed ball of center  $y \in Y$  and radius  $r > 0$ . A subset  $E \subset Y$  is called *porous* in  $(Y, d)$  if there exist  $0 < \alpha \leq 1$  and  $r_0 > 0$  such that for each  $0 < r \leq r_0$  and each  $y \in Y$ , there exists  $z \in Y$  for which

$$B(z, \alpha r) \subset B(y, r) \setminus E. \quad (1)$$

A subset of the space  $Y$  is called  $\sigma$ -porous in  $(Y, d)$  if it is a countable union of porous subsets in  $(Y, d)$ . All  $\sigma$ -porous sets are of the first category. If  $Y$  is a finite dimensional Euclidean space, then  $\sigma$ -porous sets are of Lebesgue measure 0. The class of  $\sigma$ -porous sets is much smaller than the class of sets which have measure 0 and are of the first category. In fact, every complete metric space without isolated points contains a closed nowhere dense set which is not  $\sigma$ -porous [6].

Throughout,  $X$  is a separable Banach space with norm  $\|\cdot\|$ , and its topological dual is denoted by  $X^*$  with dual unit ball  $B^*$ . We use  $S_X$  to denote the unit sphere of  $X$ . Let  $A \subset X$  be a bounded open convex set. For a real-valued  $f : A \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  we say that  $f$  is  $K$ -Lipschitz on  $A$  if  $K > 0$  and  $|f(x) - f(y)| \leq K\|x - y\|$  for all  $x, y \in A$ . When  $K = 1$ ,  $f$  is called *nonexpansive*. The *Clarke derivative* of  $f$  at point  $x$  in the direction  $v$  is given by

$$f^\circ(x; v) := \limsup_{\substack{y \rightarrow x \\ t \downarrow 0}} \frac{f(y + tv) - f(y)}{t},$$

while the *Clarke subdifferential*  $\partial_c f$  is given by:

$$\partial_c f(x) := \{x^* \in X^* \mid \langle x^*, v \rangle \leq f^\circ(x; v) \text{ for all } v \in X\}.$$

Note that  $f^\circ(x; v)$  is upper semicontinuous as a function of  $(x, v)$ . Being nonempty and weak\* compact convex valued, the multifunction  $\partial_c f : A \rightarrow 2^{X^*}$  is norm-to-weak\* upper semicontinuous. Detailed properties about Clarke subdifferentials can be found in [3], which is a sort of bible for nonsmooth analysts.

## 2 The Main Result

Let  $C$  be a weak\*-compact convex subset of  $X^*$ . Recall that the *support function* of  $C$  is the function  $\sigma_C : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  defined by

$$\sigma_C(v) := \sup\{\langle x^*, v \rangle \mid x^* \in C\}.$$

$\sigma_C$  is sublinear, and Lipschitz with Lipschitz rate  $K := \sup\{\|x^*\| : x^* \in C\}$ . Consider

$$\mathcal{N}_C := \{f \mid f : A \rightarrow R \text{ and } f(x) - f(y) \leq \sigma_C(x - y) \text{ for all } x, y \in A\}.$$

Since each  $f \in \mathcal{N}_C$  satisfies  $f(x) - f(y) \leq K\|x - y\|$  for all  $x, y \in A$ ,  $\mathcal{N}_C$  is a special class of  $K$ -Lipschitz functions defined on  $A$ .

For  $f, g \in \mathcal{N}_C$ , set

$$\rho(f, g) := \sup_{x \in A} |f(x) - g(x)|.$$

One can easily verify that  $(\mathcal{N}_C, \rho)$  is a complete metric space.

Our central result may now be stated.

**Theorem 1** *Assume that  $X$  is a separable Banach space and let  $A \subset X$  be a bounded open convex subset of  $X$ . In the complete metric space  $(\mathcal{N}_C, \rho)$ , there exists a subset  $G$  such that  $\mathcal{N}_C \setminus G$  is  $\sigma$ -porous in  $(\mathcal{N}_C, \rho)$ , and such that each  $f \in G$  has  $\partial_c f \equiv C$  on  $A$ .*

**Proof.** Fix  $x \in A$ ,  $v \in S_X$  and a natural number  $k$ . Consider

$$G(x, v, k) := \left\{ f \in \mathcal{N}_C \mid \frac{f(x + tv) - f(x)}{t} - \sigma_C(v) \geq -\frac{1}{k} \text{ for some } 0 < t < \frac{1}{k} \right\}.$$

We shall show that  $\mathcal{N}_C \setminus G(x, v, k)$  is porous in  $(\mathcal{N}_C, \rho)$ .

According to (1), it suffices to find  $0 < \alpha \leq 1$  such that for each  $r \in (0, 1/k)$  and each  $f \in \mathcal{N}_C$  there exists  $h_2 \in \mathcal{N}_C$  for which

$$B(h_2, \alpha r) \subset B(f, r) \cap G(x, v, k).$$

Of course, here  $h_2$  relies on  $r$ , but  $\alpha$  only relies on  $(x, v, k)$ .

To meet this goal, we define  $h : X \rightarrow R$  by

$$h(\tilde{x}) := f(x) - \frac{r}{4} + \sigma_C(\tilde{x} - x),$$

and set

$$h_1 := \min\{f, h\}, \quad h_2 := \max\{f - \frac{r}{2}, h_1\}. \quad (2)$$

Clearly,  $h_2 \in \mathcal{N}_C$  and  $f - r/2 \leq h_2 \leq f$ , so that

$$\rho(h_2, f) \leq \frac{r}{2}.$$

Set

$$\alpha := \frac{\min\{d_{X \setminus A}(x), 1\}}{8(\sigma_C(v) + \sigma_C(-v) + 1)} \cdot \frac{1}{k}. \quad (3)$$

If we let

$$t := \frac{\min\{d_{X \setminus A}(x), 1\}}{4(\sigma_C(v) + \sigma_C(-v) + 1)} r, \quad (4)$$

where  $d_{X \setminus A}(x) := \inf\{\|x - y\| : y \in X \setminus A\}$ , then  $0 < t < 1/k$  and  $x + tv \in A$ . Note that  $d_{X \setminus A}(x) > 0$  because  $A$  is open and  $x \in A$ . Now

$$h(x + tv) = f(x) - \frac{r}{4} + t\sigma_C(v).$$

Since

$$f(x) - f(x + tv) \leq \sigma_C(-tv),$$

we have

$$f(x + tv) \geq f(x) - \sigma_C(-tv) = f(x) - t\sigma_C(-v).$$

The choice of  $t$  implies

$$t(\sigma_C(v) + \sigma_C(-v)) \leq \frac{r}{4},$$

so that

$$f(x) - \frac{r}{4} + t\sigma_C(v) \leq f(x) - t\sigma_C(-v).$$

It follows that  $h(x + tv) \leq f(x + tv)$ , and so  $h_1(x + tv) = h(x + tv)$  by (2). On the other hand,

$$f(x + tv) - \frac{r}{2} \leq f(x) - \frac{r}{4} + t\sigma_C(v),$$

since  $f(x + tv) - f(x) \leq \sigma_C(tv)$ . Therefore, by (2),

$$h_2(x + tv) = f(x) - \frac{r}{4} + t\sigma_C(v) \quad \text{and} \quad h_2(x) = f(x) - \frac{r}{4}.$$

This means

$$\frac{h_2(x + tv) - h_2(x)}{t} = \sigma_C(v). \quad (5)$$

Assume that  $g \in B(h_2, \alpha r)$ . We will show that  $g \in G(x, v, k)$ . Indeed, by (5), (4), (3),

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{g(x + tv) - g(x)}{t} - \sigma_C(v) \\ &= \frac{(g - h_2)(x + tv) - (g - h_2)(x)}{t} + \frac{h_2(x + tv) - h_2(x)}{t} - \sigma_C(v) \\ &\geq \frac{-2\alpha r}{t} = -2\alpha r t^{-1} = -2\alpha r \left[ \frac{\min\{d_{X \setminus A}(x), 1\}}{4(\sigma_C(v) + \sigma_C(-v) + 1)} r \right]^{-1} \\ &= -\alpha \cdot \frac{8(\sigma_C(v) + \sigma_C(-v) + 1)}{\min\{d_{X \setminus A}(x), 1\}} = -\frac{1}{k}. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$\{g \in \mathcal{N}_C : \rho(g, h_2) \leq \alpha r\} \subset G(x, v, k). \quad (6)$$

If  $\rho(g, h_2) \leq \alpha r$ , then

$$\rho(g, f) \leq \rho(g, h_2) + \rho(h_2, f) \leq \alpha r + \frac{r}{2} \leq \frac{r}{2} + \frac{r}{2} = r.$$

Thus

$$\{g \in \mathcal{N}_C : \rho(g, h_2) \leq \alpha r\} \subset \{g \in \mathcal{N}_C : \rho(g, f) \leq r\}.$$

When combined with (6), this inclusion implies that

$$\mathcal{N}_C \setminus G(x, v, k) \quad \text{is indeed porous in } (\mathcal{N}_C, \rho). \quad (7)$$

Now let  $\{x_n : n \geq 1\}$  be norm dense in  $A$ ,  $\{v_m : m \geq 1\}$  be norm dense in  $S_X$ . Set

$$G := \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{m=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{k=1}^{\infty} G(x_n, v_m, k).$$

In view of (7) and that

$$\mathcal{N}_C \setminus G = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{m=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{k=1}^{\infty} (\mathcal{N}_C \setminus G(x_n, v_m, k)),$$

the set  $\mathcal{N}_C \setminus G$  must be  $\sigma$ -porous in  $(\mathcal{N}_C, \rho)$ . If  $f \in G$ , then for each  $x_n, v_m, k$ , we have  $f \in G(x_n, v_m, k)$ ; that is,

$$\frac{f(x_n + t_{n,m,k}v_m) - f(x_n)}{t_{n,m,k}} - \sigma_C(v_m) \geq -\frac{1}{k},$$

for some  $0 < t_{n,m,k} < \frac{1}{k}$ . When  $k \rightarrow \infty$ , from the definition of  $f^\circ$  it follows that

$$f^\circ(x_n; v_m) \geq \limsup_{t \downarrow 0} \frac{f(x_n + tv_m) - f(x_n)}{t} \geq \sigma_C(v_m).$$

For every  $x \in A$  and  $v \in S_X$ , we may find subsequences  $(x_n)$  and  $(v_m)$  such that  $x_n \rightarrow x$  and  $v_m \rightarrow v$ . By the upper semicontinuity of  $f^\circ$  and continuity of  $\sigma_C$ , we get

$$f^\circ(x; v) \geq \sigma_C(v). \quad (8)$$

Since  $f \in \mathcal{N}_C$ , for every  $y \in A, t > 0$ ,

$$f(y + tv) - f(y) \leq \sigma_C(tv).$$

Dividing both sides by  $t$ , and taking the lim sup as  $y \rightarrow x$  and  $t \downarrow 0$  produces

$$f^\circ(x; v) \leq \sigma_C(v).$$

Together with (8), we obtain

$$f^\circ(x; v) = \sigma_C(v) \quad \text{for } x \in A, v \in S_X.$$

Dually,  $\partial_c f(x) = C$  for every  $x \in A$ , and the proof of the theorem is complete.  $\square$

Observe that

$$\mathcal{N}_{B^*} := \{f \mid f : A \rightarrow R \text{ is nonexpansive with respect to } \|\cdot\|\}.$$

Theorem 1 gives:

**Corollary 1** *In the space of nonexpansive functions,  $(\mathcal{N}_{B^*}, \rho)$ , the set*

$$\{f \in \mathcal{N}_{B^*} \mid \partial_c f \equiv B^* \text{ on } A\},$$

*has a  $\sigma$ -porous complement in  $(\mathcal{N}_{B^*}, \rho)$ .*

It is well-known that every locally Lipschitz function  $f$  on an open subset  $A$  of a separable Banach space  $X$  is Gâteaux differentiable everywhere on  $A$  except for possibly a Haar-null subset. We need a result due to Giles and Sciffer [4].

**Lemma 1** *Let  $f : A \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be a locally Lipschitz function on an open subset  $A$  of a separable Banach space  $X$ . Then the set*

$$\{x \in A \mid f^+(x; v) = f^\circ(x; v) \text{ for all } v \in X\},$$

*is residual in  $A$ . Here*

$$f^+(x; v) := \limsup_{t \downarrow 0} \frac{f(x + tv) - f(x)}{t}.$$

Combining Corollary 1 with Lemma 1 gives the following result.

**Corollary 2** *In the space of nonexpansive functions,  $(\mathcal{N}_{B^*}, \rho)$ , the set*

$$\{f \in \mathcal{N}_{B^*} \mid f \text{ is Gâteaux differentiable at most on a first category subset of } A\},$$

*has a  $\sigma$ -porous complement in  $(\mathcal{N}_{B^*}, \rho)$ .*

**Proof.** Let  $f \in \mathcal{N}_{B^*}$  such that  $\partial_c f \equiv B^*$  on  $A$ . Consider the set

$$S_f := \{x \in A \mid f^+(x; v) = f^\circ(x; v) \text{ for all } v \in X\}.$$

By Lemma 1,  $S_f$  is a residual set in  $A$ . If  $f$  is Gâteaux differentiable at  $x$ , then  $f^+(x; v) = \langle \nabla f(x), v \rangle$  for every  $v \in X$ , and so  $x \notin S_f$  since  $\partial_c f(x) = B^*$ . Therefore, such an  $f$  is at most Gâteaux differentiable on  $A \setminus S_f$ , which is a first category subset in  $A$ . Since the set

$$\{f \in \mathcal{N}_{B^*} \mid \partial_c f \equiv B^* \text{ on } A\},$$

has a  $\sigma$ -porous complement in  $(\mathcal{N}_{B^*}, \rho)$  by Corollary 1, the result is proved.  $\square$

Finally, for various generic aspects of Lipschitz functions with maximal Clarke subdifferentials on general Banach spaces, we refer readers to [2]

## References

- [1] J.M. Borwein, Xianfu Wang, Lipschitz functions with maximal subdifferentials are generic, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **128** (2000), 3221–3229.
- [2] J.M. Borwein, W.B. Moors, Xianfu Wang, Generalized subdifferentials: a Baire categorical approach, *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* **353** (2001), no. 10, 3875–3893.
- [3] F.H. Clarke, *Optimization and Nonsmooth Analysis*, Wiley Interscience, New York, 1983.
- [4] J.R. Giles and S. Sciffer, Locally Lipschitz functions are generically pseudo-regular on separable Banach spaces, *Bull. Austral. Math. Soc.* **47** (1993), 205–212.

- [5] S. Reich, A.J. Zaslavski, The set of noncontractive mappings is  $\sigma$ -porous in the space of all non-expansive mappings, *C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris* **333** (2001), 539–544.
- [6] L. Zajicek, Small non- $\sigma$ -porous sets in topologically complete metric spaces, *Colloq. Math.* **77** (1998), 293–304.

Faculty of Computer Science, Dalhousie University, 6050 University Avenue, Halifax, NS.,  
Canada, B3H 1W5  
Email: jborwein@cs.dal.ca

Department of Mathematics and Statistics, UBC Okanagan, 3333 University Way, Kelowna,  
BC., Canada V1V 1V7  
E-mail: Shawn.Wang@ubc.ca